Email: **instituteforreplication@gmail.com**

X: **https://twitter.com/I4Replication**

Webpage: **https://i4replication.org/**

Institute for Replication
ZBW Open Science Retreat

Abel Brodeur

University of Ottawa
Institute for Replication

Institute for Replication (I4R)

- **Launched in 2022**

- **Objectives:**

  – Mass reproduction and replication

  – Change norms through collaborations with editors, original authors and replicators

- **Initial focus on economics and political science:**

  – Now collaborations with Nature Human Behaviour and Psychological Science

  – Public health and ecology/environment

Which Studies Are Reproduced/Replicated?

- **Start with journals that have a data availability/code policy:**

    – Selected top economics and political science journals

    – List here: https://i4replication.org/reports.html

- **Only going forward (studies published in 2022-)**

- **Expand selection of journals**

    » Psychological Science (2024-)

    » Nature Human Behaviour (2023-)

I4R's Strategies for Generating Reproductions/Replications

– Identify studies to be reproduced/replicated

» Empirical studies published in selected leading journals

» Check if data and codes available

» Check if data can be accessed and by whom

» Then reproduce the results (or done by data editor)

– (1) **Editorial board selects replicators**

» Invitation to replicators sent by email

• Similar to requesting referee reports

» Choice of replicators is based on knowledge of the literature and data, but also data access in some cases

I4R's Strategies for Generating Replications

- (2) **Replication Games**
  - » Team of 3-5 researchers with similar interests
    - Mix of PhD students, faculty and researchers
    - Assign study to reproduce/replicate 3 weeks before Games
    - Replication during/after Games: robustness or recoding
    - Start games with "We Will ~~Rock~~ Replicate You" song

  - » 25+ scheduled events for 2024:
    - London, Toronto, UCLA, UC Berkeley, Brown, Northwestern, Seattle, Cambridge, Sydney, Melbourne, Rotterdam, Munich…
    - About 700 participants for 2023

I4R's Strategies for Generating Replications

- (3) **Admin data, non-public data and lab experiments**
    - » Payments to replicators (USD 5,000)
        - Start this stream this Summer
        - Especially key in economics with large admin data sets that can only be accessed in data centers
        - Also lab replications with new data for experiments published in top economics journals

Replicators

- **Anonymous if wanted**

- **No incentives to show that the results do not reproduce/replicate**

  – Positive and negative replications are disseminated

- **Conflict of interest**

  – Cannot be colleague, recent collaborator, friend, etc.

- **They choose "how" to reproduce/replicate**

  – Different design / research question requires different specification check

    » Identification of coding errors could lead to different checks

  – But general guidelines (with examples of specification checks) are provided to the replicators

  – Pre-analysis plan required

Once a Reproduction/Replication Is Completed

- **(1) Replicators provide report to the Institute**
  - Similar to a referee report (use a template)
  - May remain anonymous

- **(2) Reviewed by Chair and sent to original authors**

- **(3) Authors respond (if they want)**

- **(4) Publicly release as I4R discussion papers (or on OSF) simultaneously report and response**

Communication with Original Authors

- **Authors almost always respond:**

  - 95% of original authors that A.B. reached out to responded to his email, of which one author whose email bounced back

  - Of those that responded, 22% provided a short note (e.g., thanking replicators) or mentioned they could not respond (e.g., due to personal reasons or ongoing conflict in their country)

  - 54% provided feedback without a formal response

  - And 24% provided a formal response

- **Remaining disagreements for only 18% of articles in our sample**

Email: instituteforreplication@gmail.com

X: https://twitter.com/I4Replication

Webpage: https://i4replication.org/